

**MINUTES OF THE
TREASURE COAST REGIONAL PLANNING COUNCIL
DECEMBER 8, 2017**

Chairman Smith called the meeting to order at 9:36 a.m. and welcomed everyone to the meeting. He led the pledge of allegiance and requested roll call. The Executive Director announced one more Council member was needed for quorum. In order to give Council members a chance to arrive, Chairman Smith indicated the announcements would be moved up in the agenda.

The following members and alternates were present:

Indian River County: Commissioner O'Bryan
 Commissioner Adams

Martin County: Commissioner Smith
 Commissioner Jenkins, Alternate
 Mayor James Campo

St. Lucie County: Commissioner Mowery
 Commissioner Johnson

Palm Beach County: Commissioner Valeche
 Vice Mayor Bernard, Alternate
 Councilman Hmara
 Commissioner Ryan, Alternate
 Commissioner Hardy, Alternate

Gubernatorial Appointees: Douglas Bournique
 Michael Houston
 Reece Parrish
 Peter Sachs

Ex-Officios: Vicki Gatanis, South Florida Regional Transportation Authority

Council Staff: Michael Busha
 Phyllis Castro
 Kim DeLaney
 Liz Gulick
 Stephanie Heidt
 Tom Lanahan

Council Attorney: Keith Davis

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Staff provided Council members with a postcard announcing the Safe Streets Summit being sponsored by the Miami-Dade Transportation Planning Agency, Broward Metropolitan Planning Organization, and the Palm Beach Transportation Planning Agency on February 1 and 2, 2018 at the West Palm Beach Hilton.

Staff provided Council members with the 2018 meeting schedule, noting most meetings are held on the third Friday of the month. However, the November and December meetings are combined and held on the second Friday of December.

Staff indicated the Division of Water Restoration Assistance for the Florida Department of Environmental Protection (FDEP) is offering a total maximum daily load water quality restoration grant to all local governments, especially those with a Basin Management Action Plan. The due date for requests is January 31, 2018.

Staff also provided copies of two resolutions that resulted from the joint meeting with the South Florida Regional Planning Council in October. The first resolution provides support by both regional planning councils for House Bill 53 and Senate Bill 232 to establish a conservation area around the southeast Florida coral reef, which runs between the St. Lucie Inlet and Biscayne National Park. The resolution also encourages FDEP to develop a management plan and continue to request funding to do coral disease and water quality research on the coral reefs. The second resolution encourages the legislature and governor to appropriate all Sadowski Affordable Housing Trust Fund monies to the state and local housing programs, as was the original intention of the fund. Staff noted that over the last 11 years the state has re-apportioned approximately \$1.3 Billion to non-housing programs, with this region losing about \$32.5 Million.

Staff indicated each Council member was given a year-in-review sheet to show what projects have been done in the last year. Staff noted that although this does not capture every project, it does give an idea of the different projects Council is involved with through its work program. Chairman Smith suggested having staff make a presentation at each upcoming meeting to provide an update on the individual projects.

CHAIRMAN'S COMMENTS

Chairman Smith asked that everyone, in addition to providing an update from their community, share a favorite childhood or family holiday tradition.

COUNCIL MEMBER UPDATE

Council members and staff shared their holiday memories and traditions.

AGENDA

Chairman Smith indicated a quorum was now present and called for a motion on the Agenda. Commissioner O'Bryan suggested moving the items requiring Council action before the

Motion

presentation to ensure a quorum is present for voting. Councilman Hmara from the Village of Royal Palm Beach moved approval of the Agenda and Consent Agenda as amended. Commissioner Johnson from the City of Fort Pierce seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

Items on the Consent Agenda were: 3A, Financial Report – June 30, 2017; 3B, Financial Report – July 31, 2017; 3C, Financial Report – August 31, 2017; 3D, Financial Report – September 30, 2017; 3E, Minutes – July 21, 2017; 3F, Minutes – Joint Meeting on October 20, 2017; 3G, Town of Lake Clarke Shores Comprehensive Plan Amendment No. 17-2ER; 3H, Martin County Comprehensive Plan Amendment No. 17-3ER; 3I, City of West Palm Beach Comprehensive Plan Amendment No. 17-1ESR; and 3J, City of West Palm Beach Comprehensive Plan Amendment No. 17-2ESR.

**COUNCIL ORGANIZATION – MEMBERSHIP APPOINTMENTS AND
ELECTION OF OFFICERS**

In accordance with the rules and regulations of Council, the Executive Director read the following names of new Councilmembers for 2018 into the record, and asked the Chairman to certify they have been duly appointed:

PALM BEACH COUNTY

- Regular Members: Commissioner Hal Valeche
Commissioner Mary Lou Berger
Vice Mayor Mack Bernard

- Regular Member Alternates: Mayor Melissa McKinlay
Commissioner Steven L. Abrams
Commissioner Dave Kerner

- Municipal Members: Mayor Anne Gerwig (Wellington)
Councilman Jeff Hmara (Village of Royal Palm Beach)
Commissioner Mitch Katz (City of Delray Beach)
Mayor Abby Brennan (Village of Tequesta)
Councilman David Norris (Village of North Palm Beach)

- Municipal Alternates: Commissioner Paula Ryan (City of West Palm Beach)
Councilmember Robert Weinroth (City of Boca Raton)
Vice Mayor Robert Gottlieb (Town of South Palm Beach)
Mayor Maria Marino (City of Palm Beach Gardens)
Commissioner Omari Hardy (City of Lake Worth)

INDIAN RIVER COUNTY

- Regular Members: Commissioner Peter O’Bryan
Commissioner Susan Adams

- Regular Member Alternates: Commissioner Joseph Flescher
Commissioner Tim Zorc

DRAFT
Subject to Modifications

Municipal Members: Councilman Anthony W. Young (City of Vero Beach)
Councilman Bob Auwaerter (Town of Indian River Shores)

Municipal Alternates: Councilmember Ed Dodd (City of Sebastian)
Mayor Harold Ofstie (Town of Orchid)

MARTIN COUNTY

Regular Members: Commissioner Doug Smith
Commissioner Ed Fielding

Regular Member Alternates: Commissioner Harold Jenkins
Commissioner Edward Ciampi

Municipal Member Commissioner Peter H. Conze, Jr. (Town of Jupiter Island)

Municipal Alternate Vice Mayor Becky Bruner (City of Stuart)

ST. LUCIE COUNTY

Regular Members: Commissioner Tod Mowery
Commissioner Cathy Townsend

Regular Member Alternates: Commissioner Chris Dzadovsky
Commissioner Linda Bartz

Municipal Members: Councilman John Carvelli (City of Port St. Lucie)
Commissioner Jeremiah Johnson (City of Fort Pierce)

Municipal Alternates: Councilwoman Jolien Caraballo (City of Port St. Lucie)
Commissioner Thomas Perona (City of Fort Pierce)

GUBERNATORIAL APPOINTEES: Tobin Overdorf, Martin County
Michael Houston, Martin County
Michael Davis, Palm Beach County
Peter Sachs, Palm Beach County
Kelly Smallridge, Palm Beach County
Mark Llano, Palm Beach County
Reece Parrish, St. Lucie County
Steven Weaver, Sr., St. Lucie County
Douglas Bournique, Indian River County

EX-OFFICIOS: Vacant, SJRWMD
Lois Bush, FDOT (Alternate)
Loraine Cargill, SFRTA
Kathy LaMartina, SFWMD
Jennifer Smith, FDEP

Chairman Smith certified the membership, as read, have all been duly appointed.

Commissioner O’Bryan indicated the Nominating Committee met prior to the meeting to determine a slate of officers for 2018. The Committee recommended the following nominations for the 2018 slate of officers:

- Chairman: Councilmember Reece Parrish, St. Lucie County
- Vice Chairman: Commissioner Susan Adams, Indian River County
- Secretary/Treasurer: Councilman Jeff Hmara, Palm Beach County

Commissioner O’Bryan moved approval of the Committee recommendation. Commissioner Ryan **Motion** seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

Staff recognized Chairman Smith for his service and presented him with a gift.

**BUDGET/PERSONNEL COMMITTEE - ANNUAL
REVIEW OF COUNCIL’S EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR**

Commissioner O’Bryan provided an overview of the completed annual performance reviews of the executive director, noting a majority of the responses were that he exceeds job requirements. Committee discussion included how, through his leadership, Council has created an environment that attracts and retains hard-working, motivated employees. Chairman Smith stated the two organizations he works with that he feels do spectacular work are the Florida Association of Counties and the Treasure Coast Regional Planning Council. He stated Council’s staff is respected throughout the country, and that all comes from incredible leadership and staff. The Committee recommended Council retain the services of the executive director for another year and provide the same salary increase as the rest of the staff.

Commissioner O’Bryan moved approval of the Committee recommendation. Mayor Campo **Motion** seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

**SOUTHEAST FLORIDA TRANSIT ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT PILOT
PROGRAM GRANT – AUTHORIZATION TO EXECUTE INTERLOCAL AGREEMENT
WITH CITY OF WILTON MANORS**

Commissioner O’Bryan moved approval of the staff recommendation. Commissioner Ryan **Motion** seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

**RESOLUTION OPPOSING OUTER CONTINENTAL SHELF
OIL EXPLORATION AND LEASING**

Commissioner Johnson moved approval of the staff recommendation. Commissioner O’Bryan **Motion** seconded the motion, which carried unanimously.

**WASTEWATER BIOSOLIDS NUTRIENT LOADING TO LAKE OKEECHOBEE AND
COASTAL ESTUARIES – PRESENTATION BY ENVIRONMENTAL CONSULTANT
GARY N. RODERICK, CEP, REM, CEA**

Gary Roderick provided an overview of the use of biosolids as fertilizer and the impacts this practice has on the State's surface waters. Mr. Roderick's presentation is based on his detailed report *A Discussion on Wastewater Biosolids Nutrient Loading to the Indian River Lagoon, St. Johns River, Lake Okeechobee, Everglades, Charlotte Harbor Estuary, St. Lucie Estuary, and Other Florida Surface Waters*, which was provided to Council. Biosolids are the solid, semisolid, or liquid residue generated during the processing of human waste collection by conventional wastewater treatment plants. In the State of Florida, two forms of these biosolids, Class AA and Class B, are produced. Class B are generally still in a liquid form, sprayed on agricultural lands, and are somewhat regulated and permitted with nutrient management plans. Class AA biosolids have had the water removed and are processed as fertilizer. Class AA biosolids are very inexpensive and their application on agricultural lands is virtually unregulated. Mr. Roderick indicated most Florida soils do not require any additional phosphorus to supplement a majority of the state's agricultural pasture production, which includes citrus, cattle/pasture/sod, sugarcane and vegetable row crops. However, the greatest volumes of fertilizer being utilized and land-applied for crop production comes from biosolids that contain high levels of both nitrogen and phosphorus. He also provided a cost analysis showing it is much more expensive to remove the phosphorous and nitrogen from the waterways, than it is to not add them in the first place.

Mr. Roderick noted recent legislation written to reduce the nutrient loading to surface waters exempts Class AA biosolids from regulation, and there is very little regulation on Class B biosolids. He noted there are alternative disposal options for biosolids other than land application in the State of Florida. These solutions include exporting biosolids to areas deficient in nitrogen and phosphorus, or converting the organic and nutrient components of the biosolids into usable energy. Some benefits of these alternatives include: reduction of nutrients into surface waters; agriculture still has access to a cheap nitrogen source; agriculture gains lower Total Maximum Daily Load (TMDL) reduction requirements; agriculture achieves increased fertilizer efficacy; agriculture can eliminate over fertilization by biosolids; urban created biosolid disposal costs are reduced; process is paid for with existing assessed funding sources; costs may qualify for 319 and TMDL Grant Funding; biosolids and landscape waste can both be processed; excess electricity can be sold back to power company; reduction of biosolids and landscape material to landfill; total phosphorus in final ash can be sold as a phosphorus source; and reduction in the cost of surface water quality improvement.

Mr. Roderick indicated some actions the counties and municipalities can take to begin to address the biosolids issue include: Council, counties and municipalities passing resolutions to request the FDEP and the Florida Department of Agriculture and Consumer Services continue reporting and inventory requirements for fertilizers and prioritize efforts to reduce and eliminate the land application of biosolids; sending these resolutions to the Florida Regional Councils Association, League of Cities and Florida Association of Counties for their consideration; individual local governments taking ownership of biosolid disposal methods and also adopting individual resolutions specific to each municipality; Council organizing and conducting a regional summit on the issue involving all affected parties for education and exchange of information on solutions for

DRAFT
Subject to Modifications

reducing the impacts and practice of land-applied biosolids; local government commissions and councils requesting their utility director formulate individual municipal options to eliminate the land application of biosolids within 10 years; and local governments requesting the Governor and the legislature establish this effort as a State priority and establish incentives of supplemental TMDL funding for urban areas and TMDL reduction credits for agricultural areas.

Commissioner Valeche from Palm Beach County if asked the phosphorous will eventually migrate out of drain fields and septic tanks. Mr. Roderick stated that although septic tanks can be an issue, since 2010 data and analysis shows a decrease in their contribution to the nutrient impacts to our waters, and there are monitoring measures in place. Commissioner Valeche asked why Lee County was able to apply biosolids in areas where they are prohibited. Mr. Roderick explained the biosolids by definition are fertilizer, which is permitted, noting the Right-To-Farm Act considers this a normal agricultural activity. Commissioner Valeche asked if FDEP supports him in his efforts. Mr. Roderick indicated that FDEP is a regulatory agency and these activities are legal. Staff noted that Jennifer Smith, FDEP Southeast District Director, is an ex-officio representative on Council. Staff indicated Ms. Smith has expressed an interest in Mr. Roderick's presentation and, while she could not be present at this meeting, she is willing to work with Council on this issue.

Commissioner Hardy from the City of Lake Worth thanked Mr. Roderick for his presentation, noting you do not have to be an environmentalist to be concerned with this issue as it affects our state and our economy. In terms of what is allowed under the nutrient management plan process, he asked for clarification on the permitting process and why it is possible for someone to use almost ten tons an acre. Mr. Roderick explained that is the approved methodology, but noted that there is a wide range of application rates being used some of which appear excessive.

Councilmember Houston, Gubernatorial Appointee from Martin County, stated that since this discussion is primarily about agriculture, he suggested they need to be at the table.

Councilmember Bournique, Gubernatorial Appointee from Indian River County, stated there are 20.5 million people in Florida who flush their toilet every morning, plus another 120 million tourists a year, and because of Florida's geology the waste moves quickly into the water table and to our surface waters. He noted agriculture, especially citrus, has been declining for the past 15 years, so their contribution to the problem is shrinking dramatically. He stated he is glad that some of the technological options are looking more and more promising, and he encouraged Mr. Roderick to bring his presentation to the Indian River Lagoon Council. He also encouraged Council staff to reach out to the scientific community for assistance and a legislator who will provide support and possibly assist with obtaining funding for these innovative ideas.

Chairman Smith stated he feels it was very important for Council to hear Mr. Roderick's body of work to understand that there is a real issue. He stated he supports having a summit and inviting all stakeholders, including the Indian River Lagoon Council and the agricultural community. He suggested having Council, through staff, serve as organizer and convener of this summit.

Under public comment, Diane Goldberg, Treasurer of the Native Plant Society in St. Lucie County and Conservation Chair for St. Lucie Audubon, stated Mr. Roderick's ideas and information is absolutely on point and his solutions are terrific. She stated we need to ask our legislature for help,

DRAFT
Subject to Modifications

but we need to give them an alternative solution, which would be to require that the farms and ranches meet water quality standards and use best management practices. She said testing and verification must be a requirement before any water is released to our canals or back pumped into Lake Okeechobee. She stated the testing must include nitrogen, phosphates, herbicides, pesticides, heavy metals, and the new problem of micro plastics.

Chairman Smith called for a motion to give staff direction to organize an all-inclusive workshop/summit and work together with all affected and interested parties to bring the best minds and talent to the table over this issue. Commissioner Hardy moved approval of the motion as presented by Chairman Smith. Commissioner Ryan from the City of West Palm Beach seconded the motion.

Motion

Councilmember Bournique stated that it is not only agriculture that is doing the polluting, we are all to blame, including everyone who flushes a toilet, the tourists, utilities and big companies. Chairman Smith stated this is not a blame game. He indicated his perspective is that we have an issue and we need to get together the most brilliant minds to figure out where to go from here and the best way to get there. Councilmember Bournique cautioned that Council needs to not go too far on this issue and make any decisions, and that Agriculture Commissioner Putnam and his staff should also be involved due to possible financial impacts. Chairman Smith agreed that if we cannot find a solution that is neutral benefit and good for all parties involved, then it will not happen. He also suggested inviting representatives from the Gates Foundation to discuss their equipment and efforts in other parts of the world.

Commissioner Hardy agreed with Councilmember Bournique that we are all contributing to the problem, but we are not paying the true costs of our actions and he believes it is really important for each local government to figure out what they are doing to contribute to the problem. He stated this is an opportunity to bring everyone together to take the next step in terms of everyone taking responsibility.

Upon being put to a vote, the motioned carried unanimously.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. Goldberg asked Council members to contact our legislators and strongly request a delay in the employment of the 5G cell towers until studies can be completed regarding the cause of human health problems from radio frequency and radiation from electromagnetic fields. She stated these cell towers will go on every light post and electric pole and there is no recourse for the public to say they do not want it near their homes. She requested that testing be required before installation, noting that it would be harder to reverse if something is found later. She indicated there is a panel discussion scheduled for the following Wednesday by the Conservation Alliance of St. Lucie County and she has forwarded this information to Congressman Larry Lee, Jr. and Senator Joe Negron. She stated the discussion will be held in Fort Pierce at the Solar Energy Loan Fund mini-auditorium located at 2400 Rhode Island Avenue in Fort Pierce.

STAFF COMMENT

Commissioner Ryan stated she hopes to see everyone at the Safe Street Summit in February.

Councilman Hmara asked if he could get assistance on the State Road 80 Corridor Study being done by the Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT). He noted FDOT held a public workshop to gather a sense of what most directly impacted individuals in the local community. He stated at the workshop three alternatives were offered, all of which offered adding concrete. He stated he believes most in the community are really interested in a multi-modal solution, and what is being offered is basically business as usual. He stated in the western communities approved development will add 15,000 homes, with an estimate of 150,000 more daily trips on State Road 80, also known as Southern Boulevard. He noted this roadway is an important part of the Strategic Intermodal System that goes from the Glades to the coast, and this is an opportunity to look at other options and alternatives for transportation. He asked if Council staff could assist with organizing a meeting of all the stakeholders that do not feel they were heard at previous workshops. He stated they would like to get a better understanding of FDOT’s rationale and why some of the more innovative multi-modal solutions were set aside. Staff indicated work has already been done on this and they will call the consultant for FDOT to see if there can be another public meeting. Commissioner Ryan stated she, and others she has talked to, have the same concerns with FDOT’s alternative. She stated the number one explanation she has heard is the issue of land use. She suggested that since the road does cross the state, the regional planning council to the west should also be involved.

Staff wished everyone a nice holiday.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Chairman Smith adjourned the meeting at 11:39 a.m. This signature is to attest that the undersigned is the Secretary or a designated nominee of the Treasure Coast Regional Planning Council, and that the information provided herein is the true and correct Minutes of the December 8, 2017 meeting of the Treasure Coast Regional Planning Council.

Date

Signature